Annex B: Community Support to Learning (CStL) Literature Review for Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano States

March 2022

Contents

Acronyms

ANSS	Affordable Non-State Schools
CBMC	Community Based Management Committee
CLAG	Community Literacy Action Guide
CPD	Continuing Professional Development
CStL	Community Support to Learning
DELVe	Human Development Evaluation, Learning and Verification Services
DFID	Department for International Development
ENGINE	Educating Nigerian Girls in New Enterprises (DFID/FCDO programme)
ESSPIN	Education Sector Support Programme in Nigeria (DFID programme)
FCDO	Foreign, Commonwealth and Development Office
FIDA	Federation of Women Lawyers in Nigeria
GEARN	Girls Education Advocacy Research Network
GEP3	Girls' Education Project Phase 3 (DFID/UNICEF programme)
GESS	Growth Enhancement Support Scheme (Government of Nigeria programme)
GPI	Gender Parity Index
G4G	Girls for girls' clubs
HBL	Home Based Learning
HiLWA	High Level Women Advocates
ICT	Information and Communications Technology
IQS	Integrated Qur'anic School
KaLMA	Kano Literacy and Maths Accelerator (DFID/FCDO programme)
KNGEP	Kano State Girls Child Education Policy
LRP	Local Rights Programme
MDA	Ministry Agencies and Departments
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
PDI	Project Development Indicator
PLANE	Partnership for Learning for All in Nigerian Education (DFID/FCDO programme)
PTA	Parent Teacher Association
RANA	Reading and Numeracy Activity (DFID/FCDO programme)
SBMC	School Based Management Committee
SCD	Society for Community Development
SMILE	Support Mainstreaming Inclusion so all Learn Equally (DFID/FCDO programme)
SUBEB	State Universal Basic Education Board
SWEDGE	Strengthening Women's Empowerment to Deepen Girl-Child Education
TaRL	Teaching at the Right Level
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund

CStL Literature Review:
Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano States

1.0   Introduction

The Foreign, Commonwealth and Development Office (FCDO) requested a review of the literature addressing Community Support to Learning (CStL) in Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano States as part of the CStL Scoping Study commissioned through Work Package 3: Formative Evaluation of DELVe. The intent was to identify issues that may usefully inform the implementation of the Partnership for Learning for All in Nigerian Education (PLANE) Window 3.

The literature reviewed here includes programme reports, FCDO/DFID (Department for International Development) Annual Reviews, academic papers and the 'grey literature' of academic presentations, newspaper reports and blogs. FCDO provided several reports and other literature was sourced from online sources. Key issues were identified and categorised with comparisons then made between different programmes to highlight, contextualise and explain what helps and what hinders CStL initiatives.

The literature review addresses CStL provision in Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano States. Programmes that overlapped these States are only dealt with under one State-based heading but their implementation in the other States is noted. The Reading and Numeracy Activity (RANA) and the Kano Literacy and Maths Accelerator (KaLMA) programmes are addressed separately because of the relatively significant volume of literature relating to them.

Key findings are presented in the following sections:

Each section identifies: (i) the intended reach and beneficiaries of initiatives; (ii) what worked and why; and (iii) what did not work and why

The conclusion brings these key issues together and informs a series of key points for the Implementing Partner to consider.

Thematic summaries of successes and challenges for the programmes in all three States are presented in Appendices A and B.

2.0 Literature Review for Jigawa State

The review below looks at projects implemented and monitored by the Society for Community Development (SCD), Support Mainstream Inclusion so all Learn Equally (SMILE), Strengthening Women's Empowerment to Deepen Girl-Child Education (SWEDGE) and the Education Sector Support Programme in Nigeria (ESSPIN). SMILE was delivered in Kaduna as well as Jigawa and ESSPIN was also delivered in Kaduna and Kano. The findings for these two programmes are addressed here with reference to Jigawa to avoid repetition, however, they are relevant to the other States.

2.1 Intended Reach

ESSPIN focused on six states: Enugu, Jigawa, Kaduna, Kano, Kwara and Lagos. SDC focused their work in several northern Nigerian state communities including Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano in building voice so that communities could be the drivers of change. SWEDGE worked with communities to develop male champions for girls in education, and SMILE partnered with SDC in ensuring that marginalised students had access to education. Reference is also made to findings of the Girls Education Advocacy Research Network (GEARN), who examined barriers to education, and learning initiatives. All projects were present in Jigawa.

2.2 Intended Beneficiaries

The wider community, including male community leaders and representatives, marginalised primary school-going children, including girls and children with disabilities.

2.3 What Worked

ESSPIN was a DFID/FCDO funded programme which was focused on improving the quality of, and access to basic education in Jigawa (among other states). It was implemented from 2008 to 2017. ESSPIN encouraged and supported the formation of School Based Management Committees (SBMCs) whose members include women, children (both enrolled and out-of-school children – with a focus on girls), and nomadic communities as part of their integrated School Improvement Programme. Training of the SBMCs resulted in the enhancement of female student participation and the increase in participation of students with special needs. Their engagement had a positive impact on many of the schools i.e., they would offer monetary support in the form of loans to support teachers, as well as monitor teacher attendance. This resulted in many schools recording relatively higher participation rates and retention rates (De & Cameron, 2015; Allsop et al., 2016). The SBMCs also demonstrated having a positive impact on the retention of nomadic students and around child protection issues in and around the schools. The formation of women's committees and children's committees, which were successful, were part of the success criteria for SBMCs (De & Cameron, 2015; Daga, 2016; Allsop et al., 2016). School-based plans developed by SBMCs were also used to request resources from the government, linking the wider community to the local government in the management of the schools (Cameron et al. 2016, p 18).

ESSPIN successfully worked with civil society organisations, and with state and local governments to set up mechanisms enabling communities to have a voice. This included the support for SBMC forums at the state level, which brought SBMCs together to address common priorities and community issues. The positive effect of functional SBMCs on school systems and communities was demonstrated by this programme, further aiding the leveraging of federal resources to replicate this model (where it did not exist) and providing support to established SBMCs (Allsop et al., 2016, p 85).

SCD, a National non-governmental organisation founded in 1995, works in several northern Nigerian states including Jigawa Kaduna and Kano. They focus on five Thematic Areas: Education, Agriculture, Women's rights, Governance and Health/HIV/AIDS. Their success lies in linking all thematic areas through their community-based integrated Local Rights Programme (LRP). In their baseline report, they indicated that primarily they would focus on building community voices so that they could participate in making changes. They believed that their programme intervention should 'facilitate the revival of the comatose Parent Teacher Associations (PTAs) through advocacy and community dialogue and establish a functional SBMC (SCD Baseline report, 2011, p 5).

In partnership with ActionAid, SCD facilitated a stakeholders' forum on the education of the girl-child resulting in improved support and increased enrolment of the girl-child in intervention communities (SCD Annual Report, 2014, p 6). Their success also included increasing awareness and understanding of the needs of girls and vulnerable children, improving self-esteem and confidence of women in the community so that they can participate in SBMCs. They established more than 20 community associations championing education for girls and, in collaboration with ActionAid, trained members of the International Federation of Women Lawyers in Nigeria (FIDA) on advocacy and strategies for mobilizing and improving girls' education (SCD Annual Report, 2014, p 13). To build trust and foster stakeholder linkages, SCD also sponsored football events for the wider community where government representatives, community leaders and local stakeholders could participate in discussions after the games.

Other sensitisation campaigns that SCD conducted included the formation of six kids clubs in six communities, where SMILE project was being implemented, as well as thirteen mother-to-mother support groups in six communities where the SMILE project was also being implemented (SCD Annual Report, 2014, p 17). With regards to SMILE, their success, says the chairman Jake Apelle, lies in that 'project partners are empowered to implement their ideas by themselves to ensure it is relevant for the specific local context' (Roolvink & Mackay, 2021, par 4), activating a multi-level engagement strategy and in building stakeholder knowledge before the commencement of any design work on projects. SCD in partnership with SWEDGE introduced a programme to develop male champions in communities to support the right to education for girls. These male champions were also given further training to be positive and productive members in SBMCs (SCD-SWEDGE Activity Report, 2015).

The GEARN initiative was developed by the British Council as a strategy to promote girls' education by encouraging home-grown research and advocacy. This research network aimed to identify the barriers to education and assess effectiveness of interventions. They identified the positive impact that SBMCs had on the increase of enrolment, the retention of girls, and how the initial grant system that was channelled through the SBMCs supported and sustained the momentum of enrolment. It also highlighted the communities' disapproval of the cessation of the grant system. The greatest successes were seen where

community sensitising to girls' education was implemented and where provision was made for learning materials and for school uniforms and school supplies (GEARN, n.d., p 12).

2.4 What Did Not Work

Despite all the levels of engagement and the formation of male champions and giving voice to females in the communities, the PTAs and SBMC memberships were still predominantly male (SCD Baseline Report, 2011, p 16; Allsop et al. 2016). The SCD Baseline Report (2011) also shows that community members felt stretched at times by the school demands which were according to the community sometimes unjustifiable.

Allsop et al. (2016) report that communities were also concerned that should they raise all the funds and resources for their schools, this would undermine the government's commitment to spending on the schools. The report also raises concerns that heads of schools and teachers were not always willing to take any advice or work with the SBMCs. Additionally, some members of the SBMCs felt that they should be compensated for their role (2016, p 39). The above-mentioned successes of the SBMCs were not true for all communities, with some reporting that they were not aware of their existence, and in some communities, where they were active, women or children were still not permitted to participate (Allsop et al., 2016, p66).

Later reports for SCD do not indicate any improvement in PTA participation, suggesting that parents initial uncertainties about attending PTA and SBMCs for fear of being levied were not adequately addressed (SCD Baseline Report, n.d. p 25).

3.0 Literature Review for Kaduna State

The literature review for the state of Kaduna also reflects projects that have been conducted in other northern Nigerian states as well as in Jigawa and Kano. Where specific references are made to Kaduna, the source has been referenced in the section below. Included in this section is the work done by Educating Nigerian Girls in New Enterprises (ENGINE II). While this is focused on adolescent girls, there is relevance in what has been done to engage communities and to encourage girls into education. As in Jigawa, SMILE and ESSPIN were also delivered in Kaduna. Successes and challenges from these programmes will shed light on approaches to future interventions. In the case of ENGINE II, lessons can inform on programming for younger children as community contexts remain relevant to the target CStL beneficiary group.

3.1 Intended Reach

Attention is given to the affordable non-state schools (ANSS) which are defined as non-formal education institutions and are owned privately or are faith-based organisations, or Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs). The reason for this is that they represent more than 80% of all out-of-school children in Nigeria, particularly in lower income and rural population groups (Results for Development report, 2018).

Additionally, the work of ENGINE, II, a three and half year (April 2017 – September 2020) education programme funded by the UK's Foreign, Commonwealth and Development Office (FCDO) through the Girls' Education Challenge, is aimed at adolescent girls in 18 LGAs, 79 schools and 194 communities. At the start of 2020, the programme also trained 1,035 volunteer teachers – 907 of whom were retained as learning centre facilitators (Oxford Policy Management, 2020).

3.2 Intended Beneficiaries

Lower-income and marginalised population groups such as girls (including adolescent girls) and students with learning disabilities.

3.3 What Worked

Since a large number of students in Kaduna, and other northern Nigeria States, attend ANSS, the government of Nigeria has sought to integrate these religious institutions into the state system. This is supported by the Kaduna Education Sector Strategic Plan 2019-2029, which has identified the need to expand access to quality basic and post-basic education through non-formal education, as well as formal education and which includes equitable education for girls and those with special needs (2019, p 7). The Strategic Plan also recognises the importance of involving stakeholders such as civil society organisations and local communities and School Based Management Committees (SBMCs). The strategic plan highlights the importance of advocacy and sensitization, the use of incentives to encourage children to go to school, the promotion of community participation and the establishment of more non-formal education centres with improved facilities (2019, p 15). The government states that non-governmental sources of funding for educational programs in Kaduna will include community efforts from SBMC, PTAs and Community Based Management Committees (CBMCs) (2019, p 53).

ENGINE II designed a life skills curriculum to support girls to acquire knowledge and skills in a variety of domains including business and vocational skills. These skills were reported to have supported the girls in becoming more confident and less afraid of voicing their opinions (Oxford Policy Management, 2020, p 8). In order to sensitize communities to support enrolment in the programme, ENGINE ll's community engagement strategy focused on the family as the first point of support and encouragement for a girl to achieve her potential. To support the families and the girls' learning outcomes, volunteer Learning Centre Facilitators (LCFs) and trained head teachers and gender champions (often the gatekeepers at learning centres) frequently visited homes to build a supportive environment for the girls (Implementation Approaches and Success Stories, 2020). This, together with the community sensitisation approach of addressing gender stereotypes and biases, lead to a change in perception of the importance of girls' education and economic empowerment.

Furthermore, ENGINE II implemented training programmes for the SBMCs and PTAs to jointly address the challenges faced by their schools. In this way the families and wider community could contribute to the School Development Plans for a safer and secure learning environment for girls. At the state level, and through constant interface with the local government, ENGINE II identified enabling policies and collaborated with the Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs) to improve responsibilities and change policies that would support improving practices for girls' education (Implementation Approaches and Success Stories, 2020.).

SBMCs and PTAs capacity building and sensitization to support girls' learning also led to the committees and associations enforcing codes of conduct to support child protection and gender-based issues (Oxford Policy Management, 2020). ENGINE II provided training on psychological first aid and the referral systems to improve collaboration between stakeholders that were all advocates for the girls attending the learning centres.

In order to build capacity of the leaders for the non-formal learning centres for girls, ENGINE ll implemented a programme whereby formal school head teachers acted as supervisors for out of school learning centres, and this enhanced the quality of mentoring received by learning centre facilitators (Mercy Corps, 2020). The resultant improvements in teaching by the learning centre facilitators led to the girls reporting an increased level of confidence in their learning and a sense of safety for not being humiliated or punished for making any mistakes (Oxford Policy Management, 2020, p 5).

The girls themselves received training on forming clubs that would encourage peer-to-peer mentoring and they were encouraged to network with both beneficiaries and non-beneficiaries of the ENGINE ll interventions (Approaches and Success Stories, 2020, p 11-12). This led to increased attendance (Oxford Policy Management, 2020, p 5).

Due to the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic, innovative strategies were implemented by ENGINE II such as continued learning through WhatsApp, radio and SMS. This strategy proved to be successful with additional secondary effects. It allowed extended family members to engage with the children's education, thereby facilitating and supporting their learning, while also enabling greater buy-in by changing negative attitudes that might hinder participation education systems (Mercy Corps, 2020).

Parent involvement in all children education intervention was higher among literate parents compared to their illiterate counterparts and therefore a concerted effort should be made to educate parents, not only in the importance of sending their daughters to school but also in their own literacy training (Oguntimehin & Audu, 2017, p 64).

3.4 What Did Not Work

While attendance to ANSS is quite high, they do not all teach the national education curriculum. As a result, children in schools that do not follow the basic education curriculum are officially considered out of school. This offers some insights into the drivers behind the OOSC numbers in the country. Furthermore, many children, and adolescent girls in particular, still do not attend schools due to contextual circumstances such as early marriage, distance from school, poor school infrastructure and facilities, and inadequately trained teachers (Implementation Approaches and Success Stories, 2020).

Lack of attendance and attrition in the ENGINE ll programme was generally as a result of girls being responsible for household chores, farming chores or the expectation for them to engage in hawking and selling of produce. Farming, especially during the harvesting season took precedence over schooling (Oxford Policy Management 2020). Girls also faced insecure journeys home if the sessions were later in the day, and this also contributed to low attendance. Another reason for poor attendance to the programme was that many girls expected financial rewards for attending the learning centres as there had been financial rewards in ENGINE l (Oxford Policy Management 2020). The girls felt that they needed something that could be translated into earnings and were less interested in the academic side of the programme favouring vocational skills and business training only.

While goal setting was valued by the participants in the ENGINE ll programme, most participants could not recall their goals and expected that they would receive financial support from ENGINE ll to obtain their goals. Many were discouraged to continue attending the sessions at the learning centres due to the lack of financial support.

4.0   Literature Review for Kano State

The Girls' Education Project Phase 3 (GEP3) and the Reading and Numeracy Activity (RANA) and Kano Literacy and Maths Accelerator (KaLMA) programmes are addressed below (sections 5 and 6 below). Here, the literature review focuses on smaller projects and research conducted in Kano and incudes formal, non-formal and skills-based learning. This section also examines the Nigeria Partnership for Education (NIPEP) project (funded by the Global Partnership for Education (GPE)). As highlighted in sections 2 and 3, ESSPIN was also implemented in Kano, however, to avoid repetition it is not discussed here.

4.1 Intended Reach

From the literature referenced below, the intended reach for Kano was not only formal primary education, but also marginalized youth through entrepreneurial and basic skills training. Some of the literature also has a specific focus on girls' inclusion.

4.2 Intended Beneficiaries

Primary school students and marginalised youth.

4.3 What Worked

Even with support for SBMCs from GEP3, some schools were still struggling to fund teaching and learning materials. To compensate for this and to raise funds, some heads of schools engaged with communities in more creative and innovative ways such as the Chairman of Ja'en Special School who initiated a school farm and flower garden outside the fences of the school property. The proceeds of this garden and a carwash, run by members of the community, supplemented the funds needed to run the school. Not only did this support income but resulted in extended community engagement and a sense of ownership of the school (Adedigba, 2019, p 4). The SBMC membership was diverse and was composed of members drawn from traditional, religious institutions, artisans, school pupils, teachers and community-based organisations, including women organisations.

The implementation of NIPEP (spanning 2015 to 2021) has been a major driver of the State's Education Strategic Plan along three components: (i) improving learning outcomes, (ii) increasing access to basic education for out-of-school girls, and (iii) strengthening planning and management systems. Inclusive education and gender equality are a central feature of the programme which has been organised around community mobilisation. In addition to scholarships and support to female teachers, the programme provided training to SBMCs and supported community mobilisation with a focus on girls' education. Here, SBMCs were used as an entry point for working with community and religious leaders. They were trained on how to prepare school improvement plans that are responsive to the challenges girls face in accessing educational opportunities. The completion report highlights that the project has exceeded its Project Development Indicator (PDI) target on improved Gender Parity Index (GPI) in primary enrolment and investments in community sensitisation have contributed towards shifting outdated social norms and practices that perpetuate gender inequality (World Bank, 2021).

This programme also worked to improve the percentage of qualified female teachers in basic education by providing scholarships to 15,514 of these teachers to develop their skills (World Bank, 2021). The visibility of female teachers helps to combat negative perceptions of education and is an important factor because they serve as role models and advocates for girls' education. Support for female teachers to obtain the required qualification is the first step to improving their career growth and enabling more women to enter senior decision-making positions in the education sector. This helps encourages parents and community members as there is a greater level of trust and comfort when girls are perceived to be in the care or maternal figures.

Other initiatives that have been successful in Kano state are the delivery of low-cost community-based skill-training programmes for marginalised youth, which have led to an increase in entrepreneurial initiatives (Bano, 2017). These non-formal models are especially effective for 'hard-to-reach populations' (Bano, 2020, p 109). Bano states that there is great potential for expansion of non-formal skill-development as it is currently underutilised (Rose, 2013; Palmer, 2014 in Bano, 2017, p 790). The programmes were also supported by micro-credit incentives for youth.

To address student drop-out and school truancy, Bano (2020, p 119) identifies other factors that encourage children to stay in school. By taking into consideration the practical implications of many students who participate in both Quranic schools and government schools, interventions can adopt flexible models and schedules to accommodate students who attend both.

In another study, Uduji et al, (2020) explains that including ICT training in agricultural training attracted youth who were not interested in farming. This is particularly true for youths in rural and poorer communities. This was evident through the Growth Enhancement Support Scheme (GESS) which provided youths with resources to improve their own livelihoods and of the community through an agricultural transformation programme (Uduji et al, 2020, p 452).

4.4 What Did Not Work

Entrenched and complex economic and social constraints to girls' education persist. Despite the success of NIPEP in improving primary enrolment rates, the project completion report (World Bank, 2021) shows that gender gaps still widened as children progressed through basic education. Demand-side interventions on girls' education require a sustained (and expanded) programming strategy to prevent this drop off which is often driven by livelihood priorities (further discussed below). In addition, while investments in training female teachers was a positive factor for encouraging enrolment, it was not found to be sufficient to improving student learning outcomes. Teacher absenteeism remains a major unaddressed challenge (World Bank, 2021). Improved policies and practices around teacher recruitment, selection, salary and career growth, coupled with improved school level working conditions can help to improve motivation and accountability.

The NIPEP programme also reported delays and confusion in the early years of implementation because schools and communities were not aware of the project interventions. Information on the scholarship

selection process and the requirements for establishing SBMCs was not effectively disseminated, causing delays in building partnership and trust with beneficiary communities at the start (World Bank, 2021).

With regards to the skills-based entrepreneurial programme for marginalised youths (Bano, 2017), what proved to be disappointing was that by the end of the intervention 96% of participants wanted to start their own businesses, when in fact a later survey indicated that only 30% had started their own business. As explained by Bano, 'it is difficult to pursue these aspirations unless there are improved linkages with the employment market, or easy availability of seed capital' (Bano, 2017, p 800).

It is also clear that when it comes to alternative forms of education, particularly for marginalized youths, donors appear to prioritise primary education, when instead communities are more concerned with learning skills that would support their survival needs (Bano, 2018, p 802). This points to a greater need to include community preferences – in this case, designing programmes that facilitate skills acquisition.

5.0 Literature Review for RANA

While RANA only included one of the three identified states – Kano – there is great relevance to the study particularly in the way the implementers engaged communities in sensitising enrolment for girls in schools and in integrated learning opportunities in formal government schools and in Integrated Qur'anic Schools (IQSs) which are more community-based learning centres. RANA's formal school interventions have relevance but the interventions (and lack thereof) in the IQSs is of interest and relevance to looking for ways to engage in informal or community-based learning for marginalised children.

GEP3, managed by the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) and funded by the DFID was an 8-year project that took place between the years of 2012 and 2020. The project focused on improving learning outcomes of girls in five Northern Nigerian States, with a sixth state being added in year 6. A series of interventions focused on improving school access, retention and learning outcomes, and were implemented in both primary and IQSs.

The intervention had three key components at school and community level: the provision of a package of Hausa-medium teaching and learning materials to schools; early grade professional development for teachers and head teachers (including monthly school visits); and a set of community awareness and engagement activities to support early grade literacy (Pellens et al. 2018, p 8).

5.1 Intended Reach

120 public schools, 80 IQS (half of each were control groups and the other half received the interventions).

5.2 Intended Beneficiaries

Primary school aged girls in six Local Government Areas (LGAs) in Zamfara and Katsina states were initially identified. Bauchi, Katsina, Niger, Sokoto and Zamfara were involved and Kano was included after 2017.

5.3 What Worked

GEP3 provided integrated interventions which helped to increase participation in schools, generate greater community engagement, and improve education provision. These included annual school enrolment drives, training of SBMCs on their roles and responsibilities and financial management, provision of grants of Nigerian Naira 250,000 to each school's SBMC to address key priorities that the school had identified and training of head teachers on school management and leadership.

Furthermore, and more specifically, RANA, in its broader community-based engagement, successfully collaborated with a broad range of stakeholders, including government organisations and community-based organisations including mothers' associations, to mobilise women's involvement in community activities, and increase their engagement with children's schoolwork. Their support and collaboration with these groups extended beyond education and literacy to also include other daily activities such as selling and hawking. This indicates a high level of engagement, building trust in the community and allowing for

opportunities of informal extended learning to develop. This was particularly possible through RANA's implementation of Literacy Champions in the community.

Literacy Champions were trained on developing a Community Literacy Action Guide (CLAG) and created community reading hubs that promoted engagement with literature amongst parents and students, particularly regarding storytelling, and indigenous folktales. Communities showed strong support for this programme and ongoing quarterly meetings with Literacy Champions, and SBMCs/CBMCs took place to support CLAG and reading hubs. Literacy Champions were also encouraged to attend monthly school-based meetings.

Through GEP3, success in girls' enrolment and retention was reached through the implementation of girls for girls' (G4G) clubs and the HeForShe movements addressing positive masculinity and male champions which also addressed enhanced social and transferable life skills (GEP3 Annual Review Report, 2020, p 8) such as education skills acquisition and health matters as well as social locational issues (Adeyemi., 2021). G4G state-level mentors were also implemented and trained for continued support which added to the success in girl retention at schools (GEP3 Annual Review Report 2020, p 10). UNICEF engaged with 24,000 boys and men (father, brothers, male teachers, religious and community leaders) in leading the local-level advocacy for the improved access to education for girls (GEP3 Annual Review Report, 2019). This resulted in every two girls being supported by one male champion.

Government stakeholder involvement at the national, local, and state levels was consistent throughout project implementation. Firstly, a baseline dissemination meeting took place with the Federal Ministry of Education and across all 5 states in which meetings to communicate findings occurred with GEP3 state teams, UNICEF, RANA, and stakeholders in Abuja, Bauchi, Niger, Katsina, and Zamfara over an 8-month period (Kano state only joined the programme in early 2018). Government stakeholders were engaged during baseline interviews in Abuja and the five GEP3 states in August 2015 evaluation where team members collected key informant data and also introduced the evaluation to government stakeholders (Pellens et al., 2018, p 67), as well as during midline evaluations, where stakeholders at national and state levels were interviewed in Abuja, Bauchi, Niger, Zamfara, Katsina to review Theories of Change (Pellens et al., 2018, p 216-320). Furthermore, planning of the quantitative survey involved significant communication with local government officials and RANA implementers (Pellens et al, 2018, p 306). GEP3 created a Midline Evaluation Steering Committee that was representative of the wide range of stakeholders, in order to collaboratively design a dissemination plan, receive comments on, and revise final reports.

Engagement with state-level organisations allowed for immediate feedback and potential for changes to policies influencing early learning and teacher training and certification and should be noted as an essential aspect of project implementation. Varied reports that were brief, concise and dynamic in nature were reported as most successful in communicating project progress and were frequently shared with stakeholders (Pellens et al., 2018, p. 307). It is of importance to note that a positive government attitude towards the value of education, particularly regarding the inclusion of girls, led to greater support during project implementation. This was particularly seen in the Katsina State (Pellens et al., 2018). Engaging with organisations such as High-Level Women Advocates (HiLWA) and encouraging their work with SBMCs presents an important opportunity because it allowed HiLWA to connect with school communities and mothers' associations beyond the annual enrolment drives (Pellens et al.,2018 p 69). HiLWA members are

in a position to connect with high-level decision-makers, support enrolment drives and capacity development of teachers, facilitators and CBMCs. These engagements all supported an increased level of trust and the desired increase in enrolment of girls in education as well as a shift in perception of girls in education.

Another example of community engagement was the training for CBMCs which targeted four members of each CBMC, made up of the chair and secretary, who were expected to attend training, plus two additional community members. After initial training, three members of each CBMC were invited to financial management training which was a requirement for receiving a school grant (Pellens et al., 2018, p 91). Included in the training was the development of a whole school plan addressing girls' enrolment and retention. Icunoamlak (2021) reports in *The Nigerian Tribune* that 11,000 members of SBMCs and CBMCs, of which 3,000 were female, improved skills on teamwork and community mobilization. This all was directed at promoting girl's enrolment in schools.

Contextualised training for IQS facilitators was particularly successful and included contextualised teaching materials in mother-tongue languages. This was believed to also increase the levels of motivation of the IQS facilitators. The training of CBMC to include Whole Centre Development Plans proved successful and included prioritised actions to be carried out for the year.

Furthermore, and to maintain momentum in the programmes that RANA implemented, RANA hosted a Technical Working Group that brought together RANA state team leads and state-level education officials. The group met quarterly to discuss implementation challenges and to identify areas where the states can support the implementation of RANA (Pellens et al., 2018, p 87). UNICEF also engaged in further support for community leaders through support for the G4G leaders and in order to keep the momentum going for girls enrolling and staying in schools, they engaged in 'back to school' drives once schools reopened using radio and making announcements in churches and Mosques.

5.4 What Did Not Work

In the early reports of the programme, schools were expected to share their expenditures on a community board in the interest of transparency. However, due to limited financial management capacity, this was not carried out as expected (Pellens et al., 2016).

For all the above-mentioned successes, annual reports show that the majority of outcome indicators were partially or fully achieved. There is insufficient evidence to state that learning outcomes were improved for the intended beneficiaries in the IQSs in particular. It appears that while enrolment did improve, through the enrolment campaigns, the longevity of girls staying in school and girls' learning did not have any significant improvement. This could be attributed to the low levels of teaching capacity and governance, particularly in the early stages of the intervention.

The formation of CBMCs as well as the unconditional cash transfer to female caregivers which had merit in increasing enrolment, did not bear the anticipated success particularly in the early stages primarily due to the lack of capacity and resources in the schools and in the IQSs (Pellens et al., 2016). Communities of IQSs were required to source their own school resources, and that together with unqualified teachers and a lack of knowledge on governance, could have led to the attrition of girls and the low levels of learning

success. Capacity building was implemented by RANA from the third year onwards and contextualized intervention for the facilitators in IQSs in particular were successful.

While engaging all stakeholders in the CBMCs, which has had a positive impact on the acceptance of IQSs, the levels of teaching and facilitating learning were low and the incentives were directed at enrolment which unintentionally did not support longevity or improved learning outcomes (Pellens et al., 2016; Pellens et al., 2018). Government support of IQSs remains limited with relatively few IQSs receiving support. As a result, communities indicated low levels of trust that the government would provide the assistance needed.

IQSs that had only one teacher other than the religious teacher, were less likely to succeed due to the lack of any formal or peer support and peer evaluation. Additionally, CBMCs were more successful when religious leaders and leaders in the community were part of the CBMC. In some cases, the low levels of education in the community itself led to a lack of awareness of poor quality teaching and governance. In addition, a majority of the teachers in IQSs were male, suggesting a stronger and more entrenched gender bias to teaching and learning (Pellens et al., 2016). This is supported by the fact that there were some female facilitators in the IQSs who were denied access to training.

6.0 Literature Review for KaLMA

Kano Literacy and Maths Accelerator (KaLMA) aimed to build foundational Maths, Hausa, and English literacy skills for school-going children in Dawakin Tofa and Wudil in Kano State, Nigeria. The programme was funded by FCDO-Nigeria and led by the Kano State Universal Basic Education Board in partnership with the British Council TARL-Africa, the Sa-adatu-Rimi College of Education and the Kano Ministry of Education

A key component of the programme was to train 1,081 educators comprising 763 primary teachers, 181 head teachers/ deputy head teachers, 102 student teachers and 35 School Support Officers/ School Mobilisation Officers / Quality Assurance Officers in the KaLMA methodology. This comprises Teaching at the Right Level (TARL) methodology for Maths and Hausa literacy, as well as for English literacy, using the British Council's dual language approach (Policy Brief 2, n.d., p2).

Due to the pandemic some of their programmes were halted and redesigned, and GEP3 partners assisted the government with their 'education-in-emergency response', repurposing materials to suit home teaching by using radio programmes and other social media. Additionally, materials were translated to the home language Hausa, in order to bridge the learning to another language, in this case, English.

6.1 Intended Reach

While the original intended reach was 37,000 Primary 4, 5 and 6 girls and boys, with the implementation of the radio and Home Based Learning (HBL) initiatives, 4.8 million households were reached (Aikulola, 2021).

6.2 Intended Beneficiaries

School-going aged boys and girls in Primary 4, 5 and 6.

6.3 What Worked

KaLMA was officially launched in October 2019 but its pilot programme was put on hold from April 2020 until December 2020 and the bulk of the programme re-started in January 2021. Prior to the onset of the pandemic, KaLMA partners had already opted to support a hybrid learning model which consisted of in-school elements and HBL support components. This was scaled up at the onset of the pandemic.

In order to not compromise the programme, innovative and multi-faceted approaches were developed to continue to reach the beneficiaries. The HBL initiative was launched. Materials were translated into Hausa so that parents, caregivers and community leaders could step in as teachers. Materials were published in both English and Hausa. Students and parents reflected that this helped in their learning of the English language. The HBL included radio broadcasts, text messages, automated voice messages and a toll-free line to provide HBL assistance to families in Wudil and Dawakin Tofa, but had a wider reach than originally intended.

Additionally, educators were also supported with continuing professional development (CPD) delivered via WhatsApp, text messages and automated voice messages in Maths and English. The objectives of the Maths CPD programme were to strengthen teachers' skills in basic Maths operations and to refresh their knowledge and application of the TaRL methodology with regards to Maths activities. The Maths CPD programme provided educators with content via WhatsApp and SMS (Policy Brief 2, n.d., p 3). Despite these interventions being remote, teachers did improve in their English proficiency skills and in their mathematical skills. Data however was only collected from Whatsapp users which comprised only one third of the educators (Policy Brief 2, n.d., p 4). Female educators had less time for the CPD programmes than their male counterparts due to their own caregiving responsibilities.

The HBL model continued to be developed based on high-frequency tracking surveys set up by the British Council and TaRL Africa. The augmentations included learning level targeted messages, radio programmes and worksheets. An unintended outcome was the significant increase in caregiver engagement in their children's learning. HBL support from parents and caregivers increased by 43% for male caregivers and by 50 % for female caregivers. In the fourth cycle of tracking, caregiver engagement from those who had received support from the onset of school closure in March till June were reported between 91% and 100%, compared to just 68% of caregivers who had received support for less than two weeks (Policy Brief 1, n.d., p 3).

An unintended outcome of this initiative is that more women were able to engage in their children's learning because they were able to do so from their homes which created an empowerment opportunity for female caregivers. All the caregivers requested to continue receiving learning content via text messages (Policy Brief 1, n.d). Text messages, they believed, were more effective as it allowed for convenient and flexible teaching times. By enabling the parents to empower their children through learning, a broader and more engaged learning community was created.

When schools reopened the number of parents engaging with HBL dropped, but that steadily increased, despite parents going back to work. From January to August 2021, despite schools having reopened, student engagement with HBL doubled. However, English engagement was the lowest behind Hausa and Maths (Policy Brief 4, n.d., p 4).

6.4 What Did Not Work

While engagement with radio lessons did increase over time, the fixed times for lessons and the fact that radio was not accessible in some remote areas, made this a less favourable mode of accessing learning for some. Phone assessments and phone interviews were not as effective as children were not always with their caregivers when the phone calls were made.

It is important to note that female caregivers and female teachers had less time to devote to teaching their own children or to CPD, due to the fact that they had their own home and caregiving responsibilities (Policy Brief 2, n.d., p 5).

7.0   Conclusion

Main themes emerging from the literature are addressed in Appendices A and B. This section highlights the most prevalent themes that had a positive impact in community support to learning, as well as a summary of recurring themes that challenged successful intervention.

The programmes highlighted in this literature review all **adopt a multi-faceted approach to reach learners**. They offer useful lessons on what has worked and where challenges remain. These interventions all aim to provide meaningful educational opportunities, as well as help children – and communities by extension – to engage with those opportunities. One issue which cuts through all these programmes is the challenge of scaling up of successful elements of programmes. This underscores concerns around funding, capacity, and relevance of interventions in the local context.

A range of successful strategies have been identified in this literature review and they are summarised below:

1. **Engaging the parents** in sensitisation and in forums before implementation of programmes as well as continued engagement throughout the programmes, were more successful in meeting their objectives and in supporting the communities to access learning for their children. While this review shows that parental involvement in all children education intervention is higher among literate parents compared to their illiterate counterparts, a concerted effort in educate parents – not only in the importance of sending their daughters to school but also in their own literacy training – can have multiplier effects in terms of engagement with learning opportunities.

2. **Engaging women in the community** through mothers' groups, PTAs, and in working alongside organisations such as HiLWA did increase the engagement of women in CBMC and SBMCs. It also had the positive impact of creating role models for the younger girls (especially in the literature champions) and it gave voice to women caregivers. This was most notable when programmes were adapted to meet the challenges of the pandemic. An unintended outcome of that change was that more women engaged in their children's learning and they themselves participated in the learning.

3. It was critical for programmes to ensure that membership of the SBMC and CBMCs were diverse and included influential and respected members of the wider community. Therefore, **engaging the wider community fostered support and goodwill towards schools and learning opportunities**, particularly when communities participated in activities beyond academia, such as the farming and small business initiatives that the schools encouraged in order to raise funds to support the schools. Support for more IQSs in the capacity building of the facilitators and CBMCs, who, based on the data of several reports, demonstrate high levels of commitment to implementing their training and interventions, would be beneficial as they reach further into communities than government schools. In this way, there should be a **balance between government support and 'community ownership'** which could also be done through advocacy groups such as HiLWA who were more engaged in some states with both SBCM and CBMCs.

4. With the onset of the pandemic, programme implementers had to be innovative to keep beneficiaries and communities engaged. The **use of social media and technology** exceeded all expectations in reach, and in engagement. In other non-formal programmes such as the agricultural programmes, the integration of technology engaged youth in farming activities. **There is a definite advantage to scaling its use even in the most remote areas**. It is cost-effective, safe and easy to adapt since feedback through the platforms is instant. There are challenges when using technology too, especially when using platforms that require the internet or smart phones as this does eliminate some poorer and more rural communities. Fixed programmes on radio do reach these communities, but the lack of flexibility in airing sessions at fixed times did prove to be challenging where children in communities were expected to assist with farming and hawking.

5. As the highest levels of influence in education for any community, **government engagement** is paramount. Many communities do not have any trust in their local governments and this relationship needs to be improved on. **Where the local government is engaged and has created platforms for communities to express concerns, there has been more proactive engagement from communities and more success in children accessing schools**.

6. **Capacity Building and Sensitisation is important**. Where implementation occurred before capacity building, the programmes were less successful and ended up creating trust issues between all stakeholders. Where capacity building of SBMCs, CBMCs, teachers and facilitators was supported and incentivised, the success rates were higher in terms of enrolling and retaining girls in particular. This was also true for communities that received extensive information and sensitising to new thoughts and projects implementation such as enrolment of the girl-child in schools. Support materials that were produced in both English and Hausa were well received and Hausa materials for facilitators in IQSs increased the participation and motivation levels of those facilitators. In addition, consideration should be given to actively facilitate female educators' participation in CPD activities. In order to do this one would have to look at optimal times for engagement due to the fact that many of the female educators are also primary caregivers

7. **Programming should be sensitive to contextual challenges**. Contextual challenges particularly around safety and security remain high and are the most difficult to overcome. This also includes distance from schools for students to commute and the potential dangers they may encounter on their way too or from school. Contextual challenges also include the farming and harvesting seasons as well as the socio-economic standing of individual families. This is because the need to cultivate and acquire food and basic living needs is immediate and outweighs the benefits of schooling for the family.

8. In every project there were constraints due to either the lack of financial support or the lack of resources. **Programmes that were able to secure/provide financial support were most effective**. CBMCs and SBMCs were also expected to source additional funds to support their schools. Some communities were more successful than others and some communities reported not being involved at all in any of the initiatives for fear of being levied. Additionally, where there were financial rewards, the expectations needed to be managed particularly when the financial grants or supports were discontinued

**CStL Literature Review:
Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano States**

The themes provide a guide on the considerations that can enable the success of interventions. **They all point to the issue of ownership**. Therefore, the needs of communities must come first in the design of initiatives. Pertaining to this, one recurring issue is that of relevance and the value of the learning opportunities provided, as perceived by communities. However, many programmes still prioritise primary education without appreciating that communities are more concerned with acquiring skills that would support their survival needs – often, vocational skills. This literature review suggests that interventions that can integrate foundational skills with technical skills acquisition may be more viable in some cases.

7.1 Issues for the Implementing Partner to consider

The literature review suggests the following workflow and rollout for successful implementation of initiatives and programmes.

Taking the points highlighted above into account, the Implementing Partner should pay attention to:

- Sensitising of communities to issues around access to learning for marginalised groups

- Creating working committees, SBMCs, CBMCs, civil society organisations, with diverse membership and ensuring that influential community leaders are included as well as women and children

- Building capacity of these committees by training and coaching them in issues concerning access to learning, gender biases, identifying gender champions of literature champions

- Contextualising materials and offering materials in both English and Hausa

- Creating platforms for the communities where they can safely express their opinions and offer suggestions (give them voice)

- Supporting these committees and if the support is financial, manage the expectations

- Engaging with the committees when pivotal changes need to be made to any programme such as the changes needed when schools were shut down

- Review, augment and continue to support until ownership is fully accepted by committees for their role in facilitating and supporting learning for all their children

8.0   References

Adedigba, A. (2019). SBMC: Inside Story of Nigeria's Scheme to Reduce Out-of-School Children in Kano). Premium Times. Retrieved from: https://www.premiumtimesng.com/news/headlines/353156-sbmc-inside-story-of-nigerias-scheme-to-reduce-out-of-school-children-in-kano.html

Adeyemi, F. (2021). How effective is UNICEF's intervention for girls? The Tide. Retrieved from: http://www.thetidenewsonline.com/2021/05/12/how-effective-is-unicefs-intervention-for-girls-2/

Affordable Non-State Schools in Kaduna State, Nigeria. (2018). Results for Development. Retrieved from: https://www.r4d.org/wp-content/uploads/Kaduna-Case-Study_Final_Version3_May24_2018.pdf

Aikulola, S. (2021.) KaLMa Empowers over 30 000 students. The Guardian. Retrieved from: https://guardian.ng/art/revue/kalma-empowers-over-30000-students/

Allsop, T., Nnodu, I., Jones, S., Rai, S., & Watts, M. (2016). Study of ESSPIN's support to capacity development in education in Nigeria. Edoren. Retrieved from: https://edorennigeria.files.wordpress.com/2014/07/final-synthesis-report_esspin_nov25th_2016v3.pdf

Assessing Girls' Education in Northern Nigeria: Studies from Selected Communities in Six States. Girls' Education Advocacy and Research Network. (n.d.). Retrieved from: https://www.britishcouncil.org.ng/sites/default/files/new_assessing_girls_education_in_northern_nigeria.pdf

Bano, M. (2017;2018). Skills development and international development agenda setting: Lessons from an intervention in northern nigeria. European Journal of Development Research, 30(5), 789-808. Retrieved from: https://doi.org/10.1057/s41287-017-0125-0

Bano, M. (2020). Barriers to primary completion and transition in northern nigeria: Evidence from a non-formal schooling intervention. Compare, 50(1), 107-122. Retrieved from: https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2018.1510304

Baseline Study Report- Ensuring Quality Education and Community Participation in selected FCT and Jigawa State communities. (2011). Submitted to Society for community Development. Retrieved from: https://scdnigeria.org/scd-baseline-study-report-on-fct-and-jigawa-state-communities/

Cameron, S., Keck, K., Aghajanian, A., & Majeed, Z. (2016). ESSPIN Composite Survey 3

Daga, R. (2016). ESSPIN Composite Survey 3: Gender and Inclusion Report. Oxford Policy Management. Retrieved from: http://nigeria-education.org/literature/esspin-composite-survey-3-gender-and-inclusion-report

DAI Nigeria. Booster initiative for girls' education in northern Nigeria. A gender analysis of the Kaduna state education policies and a situation analysis of girls' education in the state. (2020).

De, S., & Cameron, S. (2015). ESSPIN Composite Survey 2: Gender and Inclusion Report. Oxford Policy Management. Retrieved from: http://nigeria-education.org/literature/esspin-composite-survey-2-gender-and-inclusion-report

Educating Nigerian Girls in New Enterprises. A summary of findings from the programme's evaluations. (2020). Oxford Policy Management. Retrieved from: https://nigeria.mercycorps.org/sites/default/files/2020-12/ENGINE-II-Summary-of-evaluation-findings_final.pdf

Evaluation of Alphabetic vs Syllabic Approach to Teaching Reading in Hausa Language: Evidence from RANA Light. (2019).

Girls' Education Project 3 (GEP3). Annual Review – post April 2018. (2019). UK- The Foreign, Commonwealth & Development Office. Retrieved from: https://devtracker.fcdo.gov.uk/projects/GB-1-202643/documents

Girls' Education Project 3 (GEP3). Annual Review Template – September 2020. (2020). UK- The Foreign, Commonwealth & Development Office. Retrieved from: https://devtracker.fcdo.gov.uk/projects/GB-1-202643/documents

Kaduna State Education Sector Strategic Plan 2019 - 2029. (2019). Ministry of Education, Science and Technology. Retrieved from: https://education.kdsg.gov.ng/wp-content/uploads/2020/02/KDSE-Strategic-Plan.pdf

Kano Literacy and Maths Accelerator (KaLMA) overview. (n.d.). British Council. Retrieved from: https://www.britishcouncil.org.ng/sites/default/files/kalma_overview_final.pdf

Michael, I. (2021). UNICEF Supported GEP3: Girls Enrolment In Bauchi Hit 1,130,465 In 2020. Nigerian Tribune. Retrieved from: https://tribuneonlineng.com/unicef-supported-gep3-girls-enrolment-in-bauchi-hit-1130465-in-2020/

Morrell, A., & Grant, C. (2021). Low-tech home-based learning support for children in Kano State, Nigeria. The Education and Development Forum- UKFIET. Retrieved from: https://www.ukfiet.org/2021/low-tech-home-based-learning-support-for-children-in-kano-state-nigeria/

Oguntimehin, Y. A., & Audu, F. N. (2017). Gender and Community influence as determinants of children access to basic education in Kaduna State, Nigeria. Bulgarian Journal of Science and Education Policy, 11(1), 51. Retrieved from: https://web.p.ebscohost.com/ehost/detail/detail?vid=0&sid=e491ac0b-1d62-40c8-bee5-e6f03028e9f8%40redis&bdata=JkF1dGhUeXBlPXNoaWImc2l0ZT1laG9zdC1saXZlJnNjb3BlPXNpdGU%3d#AN=123557739&db=eue

Oxford Policy Management (2016). Overall ESSPIN report. Retrieved from: http://nigeria-education.org/literature/overall-findings-and-technical-report-esspin-composite-survey-3-2016

Pellens, T., Binci, M., Majeed, Z., Keck, K., Kveder, A., Kellenher, F., Wallin, J., Bischler, J., Beavis, A., De, S., Cameron, S., Tesfay, N., Emmott, S., Adedrian, S., Buba, M., & Pugh, T. (2018). Midline

Evaluation of UNICEF's DFID-funded Girls' Education Project Phase 3 Technical Report. Edoren. Retrieved from: http://www.nigeria-education.org/edoren/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/OPM-GEP3-Midline-Evaluation-Technical-Report.pdf

Pellens, T., Outhred, R., Binci, M., Majeed, Z., Wallin, J., Kellenher, F., Aslam, M., & Rai, S. (2016). Evaluation of UNICEF Girls' Education Project Phase 3 (GEP3). Edoren. Retrieved from: http://nigeria-education.org/literature/evaluation-unicef-girls%E2%80%99-education-project-phase-3-gep3-baseline-synthesis-report

Pellens. T., Outhred, R., Majeed, Z., Kveder, A., Binci, M., Wallin, J., Kelleher, F., Beavis, A., & Rai, S. (2016). Evaluation of the Girl's Education Project 3 Baseline Technical Report. Edoren. Retrieved from: https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/678837/Baseline-Evaluation-of-the-Girls-Education-Project-3-GEP-3-Nigeria-Technical-Report.pdf

Policy Brief 1: Keeping households engaged in learning during school closures: Low tech learning support for children in Kano State, Nigeria. (n.d.). British Council. Retrieved from: https://www.britishcouncil.org.ng/sites/default/files/kalma_policy_brief_1_final.pdf

Policy Brief 2: Providing Continuing Professional Development (CPD) using EdTech and remote learning during school closures for educators participating in the Kano Literacy and Maths Accelerator Project, Nigeria. (n.d.). British Council. Retrieved from: https://www.britishcouncil.org.ng/sites/default/files/kalma_policy_brief_2_final.pdf

Policy Brief 4: Kano Literacy and Maths Accelerator (KaLMA) – Encouraging continued engagement with learning at home as schools reopen after the COVID-19 pandemic. (n.d.). British Council. Retrieved from: https://www.britishcouncil.org.ng/sites/default/files/kalma_policy_brief_4_hbl.pdf

RANA Learn. Community mobilization and reading promotion.(2020) Retrieved from: https://www.fhi360.org/resource/rana-learn-community-mobilization-and-reading-promotion

Roolvink, L., & Mackay, G. (2021) SMILE: Designing a Participatory Project to Promote inclusive education in Nigeria. The Education and Development Forum- UKFIET. Retrieved from: https://www.ukfiet.org/2021/smile-designing-a-participatory-project-to-promote-inclusive-education-in-nigeria/

Scaling up intervention for girls: Lessons learned from ENGINE II program. (2020). Mercy Corps. Retrieved from: https://nigeria.mercycorps.org/blog/lessons-learned-engine-ii-program

SCD- Swedge Activity Report Form- Training of Male Champion in FCT on Right to Education and SBMC. (2015). Retrieved from: https://scdnigeria.org/scd_swedge-training-report-on-male-champions-on-right-to-education-sbmc-2/

Society for Community Development- Baseline Study Report- Ensuring Quality Education and Community Participation in selected FCT and Jigawa State communities. (2011). Retrieved from: https://scdnigeria.org/scd-baseline-study-report-on-fct-and-jigawa-state-communities

Society for Community Development. (2014). 2014 Annual Report. Kebbi Bauchi Jigawa Kano Kaduna Niger Nasarawa Kwara Edo Kogi Imo Rivers Plateau FCT. Retrieved from: https://scdnigeria.org/2014-annual-report-2/

The Reading and Numeracy Activity (RANA) Expansion Programme. (2020) Final Report retrieved from: Retrieved from: https://www.fhi360.org/projects/reading-and-numeracy-activity-rana

The Reading and Numeracy Activity (RANA)- Final Report. (n.d.)

Transforming the Lives of Marginalised Girls and Young Women: Engine II Implementation Approaches and Success Stories. (2020). Mercy Corps. Retrieved from: https://nigeria.mercycorps.org/sites/default/files/2020-12/ENGINE-II-Implementation-approaches-and-success-stories.pdf

Uduji, J. I., Okolo-Obasi, E. N., & Asongu, S. A. (2021). Does growth enhancement support scheme (GESS) contribute to youth development in informal farm entrepreneurship? Evidence from rural communities in Nigeria. Journal of Enterprising Communities., 15(3), 451-476. Retrieved from: https://doi.org/10.1108/JEC-06-2020-0116

Voices from Kano State. Kano Literacy and Maths Accelerator (KaLMA) English by Radio. (n.d.). British Council. Retrieved from: https://www.britishcouncil.org.ng/sites/default/files/kalma_english_literacy_radio_case_studies_final.pdf

World Bank (2021). Implementation Completion and Results Report. World Bank Group. Retrieved from: https://documents1.worldbank.org/curated/en/740801614005370353/pdf/Nigeria-Partnership-for-Education-Project.pdf

Appendices

Appendix A: Successes in CStL provision

Recurring themes indicating **success** in Community Support to Learning initiatives identified in the literature review focusing on Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano States are presented below and cross-referenced to the types of initiative, their themes, the States in which they were implemented (including other States) and linked projects.

	Identified Support to Community learning	Theme	States	Linked Projects
1	Formation and engagement with mother's association groups, PTAs and parent support committees.	Parent engagement	Jigawa, Kaduna, Kano	GEP3, RANA, SDC, SMILE, ENGINE II
2	Building strong community support from inception stage Identification and training of literacy or gender champions in the community. Including traditional and religious leaders who wield enormous influence in communities. Developing Community Reading Champions, who can lead the development of CLAGs.	Parent engagement and wider community engagement	Jigawa, Kaduna, Kano Bauchi, Katsina, Kebbi, Niger, Sokoto, and Zamfara	GEP3, RANA, SDC-SWEDGE, ENGINE II, RANA Expansion

| 3 | Engaging with broader national and international organisations such as HiLWA and International FIDA.

Implementing community mobilization and Gender-Sensitive Programming in partnership with the Federation of Muslim Women of Nigeria and providing activities including:

• Community Reading Hubs.

• Festivals to motivate children and include community stakeholders from local government to community leaders, teachers, and private organisations and individuals.

• Activation of Mothers' Groups to promote girls' attendance.

• Recording and production of folktales and short stories in Hausa as a resource for schools and community reading hubs.

Engaging with The Society for Women Development and Empowerment in Nigeria, who work with PTA and SBMCs.

Providing scholarships for female teachers to develop their skills and offer paths for career progression. This also helps in creating visible role models in the community to encourage parents and children to engage with learning opportunities | Women in the community | Jigawa, Kaduna, Kano

Bauchi, Katsina, Kebbi, Niger, Sokoto, Zamfara | GEP3, RANA, SDC, RANA Expansion 2020, RANA Light, NIPEP |
| 4 | Contextualised teaching materials written in Hausa motivated and engaged facilitators in IQS's and other community members as well as parents. | Wider community engagement | Kano

Bauchi, Katsina, Kebbi, | GEP3, RANA, KaLMA HBL, RANA Expansion, RANA Light |

	RANA expansion 2020, reported their development of step-by step instructions to build capacity of designated Community Reading Mobiliser who would serve as local-level implementers.		Niger, Sokoto, Zamfara	
5	SBMC and CBMC capacity building, implementation of Integrated LRPs. Capacity Building for Sustainable Community Engagement is reported in the RANA expansion programme and includes activities such as: • School Open Days attended by all stakeholders. • Adopt a school programme where individuals or organisations provide identified needs.	Wider community engagement	Kano, Jigawa and Kaduna Bauchi, Katsina, Kebbi, Niger, Sokoto, Zamfara	GEP3, RANA, NIPEP, KaLMA, ESSPIN, SDC, ENGINE II, RANA expansion, RANA Light
6	Community farming projects and alternative skills-based training, particularly when the trainers are sourced from the community. Engaging individuals, philanthropists, politicians, and community-based organisations in their local communities to contribute to the learning centres' development by fixing wells, supplying drinking water to the schools and fishing and expanding on infrastructure.	Wider community engagement and training in use of technology	Kano, Kaduna Bauchi, Katsina, Kebbi, Niger, Sokoto, and Zamfara states.	GESS, ENGINE II, RANA Expansion, RANA Light
7	Innovative multi-media approach to reaching students and parents during the pandemic that has continued after schools reopened to keep parents engaged (use of radio, social media and mobile phones). Use of radio to encourage 'back to school' drives once schools reopened.	Use of technology	Jigawa, Kaduna, Kano Bauchi, Katsina, Niger,	GEP3; KaLMA HBL, UNICEF, ENGINE II, RANA expansion, RANA Light

	Bulk SMS effectively used 2-3 times a week to collect data and to bring about awareness of upcoming radio lessons. Online surveys were also conducted for parents regarding radio lessons. RANA Expansion programme created social media platforms for RANA audio lesson: including Whatsapp, Instagram and Facebook which assist in outreach beyond schedule lessons.		Sokoto, Zamfara	
8	Engagement with state level organisations and national organisations such as the traditional Leaders Forum of Nigeria. Government ownership of community mobilization strategies through the Department of Social Mobilisation in each State Universal Education Board (SUBEB). RANA Expansion reported that Major stakeholders were critical; Federal/States' Ministry of Education, MDAs, SUBEBs, State Agencies for Mass Educations, National Commission for Mass Literacy, Adult and Non-Formal Education, Universal Basic Education Commission, UNICEF and the World Bank/Global Partnership for Education-funded Better Education Services Delivery for All programme. Two day stakeholders' workshop initiated by RANA that served as a platform to institutionalize state-level technical working groups ensured buy in, technical support and more efficient M & E. accomplished the creation of state action plans that would address gaps and challenges in the programmes. Government policy reform encouraged through partnership with the Nigerian Educational Research and Development council.	State and government engagement	Jigawa, Kaduna, Kano Bauchi, Katsina, Niger, Sokoto, Zamfara	GEP3, RANA, KaLMA, UNICEF, ESSPIN, SDC, ENGINE II, RANA Expansion, RANA Light

RANA reports that 'In hindsight, the Department of Social Mobilisation should have been engaged more rigorously so that they could provide leadership on replicating the initiatives in other communities and after RANA's closure' (RANA Final report n.d., p 24). RANA engaged with state government actors to design a reading policy and corresponding government budgetary commitments as well as collaborating on a state-owned early grade reading certification program with the Federal Ministry of Education. RANA helped to coordinate the development of a state-level Hausa Early Grade Reading Implementation Guideline. Local government has a strong rural community engagement and presence in Kaduna. SUBEB engaged in the Training of SBMCs and community sensitization /awareness Campaigns in Kaduna and Kano and is the most powerful agency in girls' education due to financial and human resources at their disposal, which they also use to build capacity of SBMCs. Female-only literacy classes and the special attention to girls' education in the MDAs and in government initiatives such as the Free and Compulsory Basic and Post-Basic Education are contributing to improving the education of girls in Kano State.			

Appendix B: Challenges to CStL provision

Recurring themes indicating **challenges** to Community Support to Learning initiatives identified in the literature review focusing on Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano States are presented below and cross-referenced to the types of initiative, their themes, the States in which they were implemented (including other States) and linked projects.

	Identified Support to Community learning	Theme	States	Linked Projects
1	Prioritising capacity building of teachers, facilitators, SBMC and CBMCs prior to enrolment drives. The RANA expansion programme in 2020, reported success in building capacity of teachers and facilitator, particular through: a) developing low-cost training materials and scripted training materials in Hausa, and in collaboration with non-formal education agencies b) cluster-based training c) identifying mater trainers in the community d) conducting 4-day learning visits e) implementing monthly feedback to facilitators	Capacity building	Kaduna, Kano Bauchi, Katsina, Kebbi, Niger, Sokoto, Zamfara	GEP3, NIPEP, RANA, RANA Expansion 2020, RANA Light 2019,
2	Sensitising communities to any changes particularly where technology is involved.	Sensitizing	Kaduna	KaLMA, RANA, Policy review Kaduna

	RANA established Community Reading Mobilizers who are responsible for sensitizing, mobilizing and providing feedback to community stakeholders on improving literacy and learning outcomes. Socio-cultural issues around early marriage, teenage pregnancy, and higher incidental cost of education at the secondary level need to be addressed either through regular advocation and sensitization of the communities or the intervention of traditional rulers and parents/guardians (DAI Nigeria, 2020, p 8). The Kano State government should strengthen partnerships with civil society organisations and Community Based Organisations for more intense sensitization and mobilization activities in support of girls' education (DAI Nigeria, Kano, 2020).			
3.	Logistics of reaching rural communities particularly when introducing social media and ICT.	ICT and social media intervention	Kano	KaLMA
4	Contextual challenges that hamper execution of projects such as entrenched biases and behaviours, safety, security and the COVID-19 pandemic. The RANA expansion programme in 2020, reported implementation of mobile-based data collection to support M&E particularly that responds to available resources and prevailing political will. This highlighted the need to have political support. Hausa is not spoken everywhere in these States.	Contextual challenges	Jigawa, Kaduna, Kano Bauchi, Katsina, Kebbi, Niger, Sokoto, Zamfara	ENGINE II, GEP3, RANA, KaLMA, RANA Expansion 2020

5	Managing expectations where there are monetary rewards, or grants. Lack of financial support and resources. While suggestions are made that communities should be mobilized to provide pencils and basic materials, these expectations are not always possible. Poor communication on the project activities and support provided to SBMCs resulted in delays and confusion in the early years of implementation because schools and communities were not aware of the project interventions (NIPEP). Bureaucratic delays in the commencement of expansion programmes created uncertainty and may have negatively impacted on the perceptions of successes of the first programme (RANA).	Financial support	Kaduna, Kano	ENGINE II, NIPEP, RANA, RANA Extension,
6	Policies introduced regarding free education for both girls and boys pushed up enrolment but facilities, materials and teachers remain in short supply. Policies in Kaduna do not make provision for gender-sensitive curriculum for schools, nor do they make provision for or incentivise the recruitment and retention of female teachers (DAI, Nigeria, 2020, p 8) despite this being a focus. IN Kano on the other hand, the engagement of female teachers is given priority by the Kano State Government (through mass recruitment). The Kano State Girls Child Education Policy (KNGEP) identifies clear roles and responsibilities for stakeholders to realize the goal of improving girls' education. The KNGEP is not in use as a guiding policy in Kano State. Policies do not address the gender-specific barriers to girls' education, such as early marriage, teenage pregnancy and higher cost of education, especially at the secondary level in Kaduna (DAI, Nigeria, 2020, p 8), nor does it make	Government Policies	Kaduna Kano	Policy review

	provision for allowing young mothers to be educated despite the will of the government and the budgetary allocation.

Kaduna State is not likely to achieve the educational goals of the SDGs by 2030 (DAI Nigeria, 2020, p 18).

Inadequate collaboration and cooperation between ministry, dept and agencies in Kaduna are experienced as well as delays in the releases and cash backings of approved budgetary allocation in (DAI Nigeria, 2020).

Although the policy in Kano identified that the challenge to girls' education is rooted in culture, it provides only a limited role for traditional institutions to support access.

According to DAI Nigeria (2020), GEP3 is not using its influence to its fullest capacity in helping develop the Kano State girls education Policy . | | | | |
| | Despite the will to include girls and children with disabilities in Kano and the policy amendment in 2015 to include children with disabilities and avoid any discrimination with regards to access to school, directorates are not very effective in addressing inclusion of girls and children with disabilities. There are still several issues that influence access in Kano, these include:

- Discrimination and stigmatization of children with disabilities.

- SBMCs are not adequately trained to identify and enrol children with disabilities in the communities. On the other hand SBMCs' ability to perform their roles has been hampered by several factors, including undue | Inclusion of children with disabilities | Kaduna, Kano | | |

	interference by the Local Government Education Authority and School Support Officers. • Teachers are not adequately trained for inclusive education. • Infrastructures in mainstream formal schools are not designed with special considerations for the inclusion of children with disabilities (ramps, toilets, etc.). • Low level of public awareness on government education policies and Programmes. The policy in Kaduna does provide for second chance education for females, males and persons with special needs/disabilities that missed the opportunity of basic education or dropped out from school. The policies in Kano make recommendations rather than policy provisions and do not provide data about girls' education in Kano state to contextualize the scale of the challenge.			